

A Comparison of 4Cs' Praxis in Two Recommended English Textbooks For senior high school in Indonesia

Try Oktaviani Shalehah
IAIN Syekh Nurjati
tryshaoktaviani@gmail.com

Tedi Rohadi
IAIN Syekh Nurjati
triaincrbn@gmail.com

Zakky Yavani
IAIN Syekh Nurjati
yavaniaja@gmail.com

Abstract: this study aims to know the 4Cs skills, as a mandatory principal of curriculum 2013, in two English Textbooks which used as references in teaching and learning process for eleventh grade. The two English Textbooks studied are “Bahasa Inggris” and “Contextual English”. This research apply content analysis principles. To get the data the researcher used document analysis. After analysis, the data were interpreted, compared and reported. The research finding shows that 4Cs skills from both English Textbooks are included on its package of activities; 1) pre activities, 2) content of the materials, and 3) worksheets. The critical thinking aspects are mostly found on its pre-activity and contents, while communicative and collaborative aspects sometimes emerge on both. The worksheet requires creativity of the students as well as communicative and collaborative aspects on it. It was also found that among two English Textbooks studied, the 4Cs aspects on “Contextual English Textbooks” are shown up more frequent than “Bahasa Inggris” text book.

Keywords: 4Cs Skills, Curriculum 2013, English Textbooks, Eleventh Grade of Senior High School

BACKGROUND

In this era, the world keep changing and many things in different aspects also developing. Technology is one of many aspects that is undoubtedly paramount in 21st century. Fryeri (2005) states that technology gives children the opportunity to search for information through the internet to focus on students outcomes, to improve their skills in the 21st century about new forms of learning. It is needed to tackle the complex global challenges ahead, resilience, responsibility, risk-taking, creativity, competitive, and knowledge-based. Battle for kids (a national not for profit organization specializing in 21st century education) released a P21 model of frameworks in 2010 which is also agreed with Fryeri, by highlighting the technology used in education developed by teachers, education experts, and business, should define and illustrate the skills and knowledge students need to succeed in work, life and citizenship as the support systems necessary for 21st century learning outcomes. Moreover, technology is important for students in order to get many sources to learn beside the materials that being taught in the classroom by their teacher and improve their own knowledge and independency.

As technology use can not be separated by human's life today, either for work or completing the everyday tasks, education in 21st century demands students to be able to thinking critically, communicating, creatively thinking, and collaborating, particularly when utilizing the technology. The importance of inserting the skill is urgent in many countries both in developing as well as developed country, such as United state of America. Its former president Barrack Obama (2009) in Chami (2020), once, calls nation's governors and state education chiefs to develop standards and assessments which do not only measure whether students' ability in answering a test, but whether they possess 21st century skills like problem-solving and critical thinking and entrepreneurship and creativity. Hence, 4Cs skills creates a sense of urgent and crucial to have for students.

On the other hand, Digital content and communication tools are revolutionizing curricula and educational activities, in transforming traditional teaching and learning to prepare young people for citizenship and the global development. Due to this issue, the discussion under the 4Cs topic had been widely conducted by many researchers all over the world. The first study was done by Rodney Harshbarger (2016) who conducted a research entitled "Learning in the 21st Century: A study addressing educational trends and implication". In this study, Harshbarger analyzed 4C skills in student's ability to face global era. This study focused on teachers to provide a unit of instruction to their students which focused on the development of communication, collaboration, critical thinking, and creativity (4Cs) skills within the context of state-mandated curricular content and their challenges in implementing the 4C skills to face the global era. The challenges that discovered by Harshbarger from this study are lack of communication, collaboration, critical thinking, and creativity (4C) skills for students as they enter the workforce. This research suggests that in order to keep up with the global development, 4C skills should be adapted in the curriculum.

In Indonesian context, the emergence of 4Cs skills also has been considered by the government showing that it is a very important to notice. Kuntari (2015) notifies that 4C Skills in 21st century educational concept have been adopted by the Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia with a purpose to develop educational aspect by revising the 2013 curriculum for elementary, junior high school, senior high school, and vocational high school. Curriculum in Indonesia nowadays have been changed from the National Education Department become curriculum 2013, as time goes by, it being revised and the revised one called The Revised Curriculum 2013. Hendrayana, in 2013, give his statement about the revised curriculum which has been implemented in Indonesia start from 2017. It is a form of integrated work between the reconstruction of the passing grade competence, the suitability and adequacy, expansions, the advancement of the materials, revolution in learning and reform an evaluation.

The new curriculum includes the competence of knowledge, skills, metacognition, and character. Those skills relate to the use of knowledge and connected to feedback with knowledge. Character qualities has a use to describe how one engages with and behaves in the world. Boston (2015) stated that metacognition development also known as the process of self-reflection and learning how to learn, as well as to build the other three dimensions. 4Cs skills are implemented in the revised curriculum in 2013 with a purpose to realize the quality of students' skills in creative thinking, a flexible problem solving, collaboration and innovative skills. According to Scott (2015), 4Cs skills should be unite by teachers in teaching and learning process, because the revised curriculum which accomodate the 21st century skills and is applied nationally

demands 4Cs skills in teaching and learning process. However, this research focused on how 4Cs skills being presented and being compared in two material textbooks because the amount of 4Cs skills contained on material of one textbooks is different with the others, and the difference also affect the performance of students mastering 4Cs skills. As the candidate of the teacher, students in teaching faculty needs to know how to analyze 4Cs skills from a book and compare it with another book to know which books will be the most suitable with the lesson plans to make students develop.

The idea of 4Cs skills start from 1981, while the US Secretary of Education created the National Commission on Excellence in Education to examine the quality of education in the United States. The commission issued its report *A Nation at Risk: The Imperative for Educational Reform* in 1983. A key finding was that "educational reform should focus on the goal of creating a Learning Society". Until the dawn of the 21st century, education systems across the world focused on preparing their students to accumulate content and knowledge. As a result, schools focused on providing literacy and numeracy skills to their students, as these skills were perceived as necessary to gain content and knowledge. Recent developments in technology and telecommunication have made information and knowledge ubiquitous and easily accessible in the 21st century. Therefore, while skills such as literacy and numeracy are still relevant and necessary, they are no longer sufficient. In order to respond to technological, demographic and socio-economic changes, education systems began to make the shift toward providing their students with a range of skills that relied not only on cognition but also on the interdependencies of cognitive, social, and emotional characteristics.

On the other hand, textbook is one of many materials which is frequently used in teaching and learning process. As what declared in 2009 by Pusporini that textbook is one of knowledge sources which is the easiest to obtain and becomes one of many aids to assist the students in acquiring clear concepts of subject matter. Another expert, Iakovos (2011) also stated that a course book plays an important role in teaching; it facilitates students in learning activities because a course book offers advantages which constitute useful resources.

In Indonesian's educational system, textbooks are considered as the main components of the curriculum. National Education Department develops the content, the methods, and the procedures for teaching and learning in the classroom. They also provide a systematic syllabus for teachers to follow in teaching a certain subject. In Indonesia, the textbook designs by the authorized publishers based on the latest curriculum. Once a newly invented curriculum was launched by National Education Department of Indonesia, a number of competitive publishers involve professional instructional material writers to design or develop new textbooks which are in line with the curriculum.

Moreover, it is not a simple thing to determine a compatible course book for learning process, especially for English lesson that become a foreign language in Indonesia. It is very important for us to develop English as Foreign Language textbook evaluation so as to ensure English Foreign as Language textbooks can effectively facilitate the attainment of our teaching objectives, and at the same time, be economically viable to teachers and students. Wrong choice of textbooks would be likely to negatively affect both teaching and learning. Financial resources would also be wasted. Fortunately, National Education Department of Indonesia have arranged English materials/course book for each level of education from elementary to high school and can be used directly during teaching and learning process in school as a formal standard material taught.

However, each book has different contents as well as the 4Cs skills that being taught in it. Each book has its own characteristics and different amount of 4Cs. The textbooks which frequently used by schools for eleventh grade in Cirebon is a book entitled “Bahasa Inggris” written by Mahrugh Bashir. It first published on 2017 by the government which has a purpose to accommodate students with the new curriculum that being revised. Another book with the revised curriculum 2013 materials is published by Tiga Serangkai entitled “Contextual English”. This book written by Bambang Sugeng, Fatyana Rachma Saputri and Anindya Sekar Trinasih, and first published in 2019. This book is a side book beside the main one to help students with their study.

The first 4Cs elements is critical thinking. ‘Critical’, derived from the Greek word *kritikos* meaning to judge, arose out of the way analysis and Socratic argument comprised thinking at that time. (McGregor, 2007) and then the word *kritikos* passed to Latin as

‘Criticus’ that is the type of spreading to world languages from it (Hançerlioğlu, 1996). Sharma & Elbow in 2000 stated that Questioning is the cornerstone of critical thinking which in turn is the source of knowledge formation and as such should be taught as a framework for all learning. Students are frequently conditioned in their approach to learning by experiences in teacher-centered, textbook-driven classrooms.

The second elements of 4Cs is a creativity. E.P Torrance in 1962 give his statement on defining creativity as a process of becoming sensitive to problems, deficiencies, gaps in knowledge, missing elements, disharmonies and so on, identifying the difficulty, searching for solution, making guesses, or formulating hypotheses about the deficiencies, testing and retesting these hypotheses and possibly modifying and retesting them, and finally communicating the results. From Torrance statement, it can be concluded that creativity is to think differently and producing new ideas. Creativity also means being able to think alternatives or possibilities ideas that may be useful in solving problems, communicating with others and entertaining ourselves as well as others.

For the purpose of this research, which is to seek the 4Cs contains in two different books, the researcher decide to select those books as the main sources. The researcher will compare both of the textbooks and classify each of 4Cs skills presented in the textbook and decide which books contains more of 4Cs skills on it and can be used better in teaching and learning process.

METHOD

In this research, the researcher use content analysis. According to Ainun ningsih (2018), content or document analysis is a method which is applied for written or visual data with the purpose of identifying specific characteristic of materials. The materials can be taken from textbook, newspaper, web pages, speeches, television programs, advertisements, musical compositions, or any of a host of other types of documents. In this research, the researcher aims to analyze the condition of materials provided in English textbook for the eleventh grade.

After analyzing, the researcher do interpret, compare and report the data that described in the English textbooks by using a table of 4Cs characteristics. This kind of analysis is done with the help of words to describe any detailed conclusion or interpretation in a less biased and subjective manner. This method was found out to be suitable with the purpose of the research in examine the materials in a written and visual data provided in this English textbooks that written by Mahrugh Bashir for the first book and Bambang Sugeng, Fatyana Rachma Saputri and Anindya Sekar Trinasih for the second book.

To check the validity, the researcher comparing the analyzed data with another data which is a third semester syllabus for eleventh grade using table of analysis in table 1.3. The syllabus made by the government and it state the criteria of 4Cs that should be implemented by the teacher in the classroom.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

In order to answer the first research question, the researcher describe the finding by chapters and each chapters being analyzed whether they have all of the 4Cs' characteristics in its content or not. To describe the 4Cs characteristics, the researcher used the list of 4Cs characteristics made by the researcher based on the explanation of experts related to the characteristics of 4Cs.

The first book entitled "Bahasa Inggris" written by Makhrukh Bashir and the second book entitled "Contextual English" by Bambang Sugeng, Fatyana Rachma Saputri and Anindyka Sekar Trinasih are conducted of three parts in each chapters. All of them are pre-activity, contents and worksheets which contains 4Cs elements that explained by the findings below.

Bahasa Inggris Material Book written by Makhrukh Bashir is a book created by the government in order to fulfill the needs of material teaching and learning for curriculum 2013. It was published in 2017 and a revision from the previous material book with the same title and writer. This book consist of three parts in each chapters. There are pre-activity, contents/building blocks, and worksheets.

Critical thinking is one of 4Cs skills needed for students in teaching and learning activities. Thinking critically as what Critical Thinking Cooperation stated in 2006 is the ability that beyond memorization, as in teaching learning process, encouraged students to think, to question and to analyze, in order to develop new ideas and prove it by action, whether it in written or spoken form. These are research findings about critical thinking characteristic which can be found from two textbooks.

Pre-activities definition, according to Vacca in 1989, is the activities and discussions before reading which reduce the uncertainty that the students bring to the texts. Ajideh in 2006 also give statement related to the purpose of pre-activity that pre-activities help students to relate their background knowledge and the new information which they find in the text. However, Vacca (1989) give different statement about the purpose of pre-activity. They are motivating readers, building and activating background knowledge, introducing key vocabulary and concepts, and developing awareness of the task demands of the assignment and the strategies necessary for effective learning.

Critical thinking in book one "Bahasa Inggris" written by Makhrukh Bashir for eleventh grade are provided in form of various kinds of activities. As for pre- activities, this book use some methods to provide the aspects of critical thinking. First method is students asked to read a dialogue then after that they asked to perform in partner or make a discussions with other students about the contents of dialogue in pre- activity. In addition, sometimes it provide some questions about the contents of the pre- activities. The second methods to deliver critical thinking aspects on pre-activities in this book is students read a text/letter and answers some questions related to those text/letter.

Related to theory about contents as part of material books, Harmer give his statement in 2007 that the most important aspects of textbook use is for teachers to try to engage students with the content they are going to be dealing with. According to Yulianti (2011), a textbook is an instructional material which consists of content and material of

the subject that is well organized in written form and has a great contribution in the teaching and learning process. For the content, this book using building blocks/mind maps to explain the materials content on each chapters.

The content materials from each chapters contains of critical thinking elements on this book are using the same format, which are building blocks with some explanations of main materials. Building blocks, which are similar with mind mapping, has the main purpose like Davies stated in 2013, that is to create an association of ideas.

Worksheet as a part of book is a tool for teachers to enhance students' acquisition of knowledge and skills, McDowell and Wadding (1985). Another expert, Kisiel (2003) adds another statement of worksheets in 2003, which the statement is about how worksheet can be functioned as an advance organizer, which aims to help students to organize their observations and knowledge in a confusing learning environment.

Some worksheets in this books contains critical thinking characteristic. Worksheet activities that has critical thinking characteristics are completing the dialogue of the expressions, make a letter or a text and decide the best words or the influential words related to the materials. All of these worksheets activity consist of critical thinking aspects provided whether as individual or group work.

Based on the syllabus which explains about the things to pounder in executing teaching and learning process, the concepts of core competences are introduced. they dictate what competences to achieve form competence 1 to competence 4 (KI 1 to KI 4). In competence number 4 (KI-4) clearly stated as follows:

"Students can demonstrate the skills of reasoning, processing, and presenting effectively, creatively, productively, critically, independently, collaboratively, communicatively, and become solutional in the abstract realm related to the development of what they have learned in school, and are able to carry out specific tasks under direct supervision".

Based on those core competency above, the characteristics of critical thinking mentioned above similar to what Paul and Elder (2008) ,in their book, nexplained about critival thinking and its characteristics.

On this material book, the critical thinking aspects which shown on the material book entitled "Bahasa Inggris" written by Makhrukh Bashir have similar characteristics from one chapter to another. Eventhough the activity are sometimes different, the characteristics of critical thinking are quite similar. There are three kinds of critical thinking characteristics that clearly shown from each chapters, first characteristic is the activities helps students to be able to gather and make a relevant information about the materials. As what Paul and Elder stated, to think critically, the first step of it is by how students able to make a relevant information. The relevant information that students conducted from pre-activity, such as read a text or dialogue and the contents or the building blocks in this book can help them collect relevant information then give an argument so they can have a better understanding on materials.

The second characteristics of critical thinking which also exist in this material book is how the activity help students to be able to interpret data, to appraise evidence and evaluate arguments. Interpretation, according Veverka in 1994, is a communication process, which it has a purpose to reveal meanings and relationships of something. Based on the research findings, the building blocks, which the same as a mind map, is provided with a purpose to make students easier to collect information and interpret those information.

Lastly, the characteristics which mostly can be find and applied on each of pre-activity from Bahasa Inggris material book is how it help students to draw a conclusion and generalizations. By read a text, explanations and some examples which provided in this books, students should be able to conclude and generalize the idea of the material from each chapters.

From those three dominant characteristics, which are parts of the critical thinking characteristics based on Paul and Elder statement in 2008 which all of the characteristics provided in order to support KI-4, especially at the word “kritis” or to think critically in English, it can be conclude that critical thinking aspect can be find on some activities in this book.

Creativity in 4Cs skills is one of aspects that need to be carry out by the students. Based on statement of E.P Torrance in 1962, creativity is a process of becoming sensitive to problems in learning, deficiencies, gaps in knowledge, missing elements, disharmonies and so on, identifying the difficulty, searching for solution, making guesses, or formulating hypotheses about the deficiencies. Moreover, it also has a role to testing and retesting those hypotheses and possibly modify and retest them, and finally able to communicate the results to others.

Whether students or teacher need to be creative, and in order to be creative, the material book provided should have the characteristic of creativity to carry out both of students and teachers’ creativity. Worksheets for students which are being provided in this chapter is presented as students are asked to make or complete a dialogue related to selectable materials on each chapters, making a text or letter or choosing the rights words to make a proper text or sentences. Here are some research findings about creativity’s characteristics according to Guilford from material book one.

Still use KI-3 and KI-4 as main foundation of this research, the researcher use creativity characteristic which conducted by Guilford as characteristic reference to explained the materials provided on material book one. Same as critical thinking, creativity characteristics are have the same between one chapters to another. There are two characteristics of creativity which frequently appear on some activities. The first characteristic is how the book provide the pre-activity, contents and worksheet to help students to systematize and organize the details of an idea in head and carry it out. Guilford state it as elaboration. The students organize the idea they get from pre-activity and the contents by reading it, then they carry it out by doing tasks, both in written and spoken form. The worksheet such as create a text or a presentation help students carry out the idea they already organize.

The second characteristic which show up on activities in material book one is students are able to produce new or original idea. The activity such as make a dialogue or text are able to help students to produce their own idea, such as the idea for the topic of the text or the dialogue they will made and the way they discover some vocabularies to make it. This process, according to Guilford, is called originality.

Based on the discussions of research findings above related to the activities and the characteristic of creativity which stated by Guilford can be found, this book are proved on having creativity aspect of 4Cs in its materials.

On the other hand, “Contextual English” material book which written by Bambang Sugeng, Fatyana Rachma Saputri and Anindyka Sekar Trinasih is published by Tiga Serangkai Group in 2019 with a purpose to help students with their English study and used as an additional book to support the main book, which usually the main book are produced from the government. This book has the same structure parts with a book one.

However, the pre-activities, worksheets and the explanation of materials in this book are more vary than “Bahasa Inggris” material book.

As what already explained before by Vacca in 1989 that it is an activity and discussions before reading which reduce the uncertainty that the students bring to the texts. In teaching and learning process, pre-activity in the book has a same role with introduction. To conclude, this activity is an activity that prepare students before they learn the main materials.

Based on the research findings, the form of pre-activity on each chapter are similiar, which is answering some questions. The difference only the source to get the informations are sometimes different. The source’s forms are a text, a table, a map or a pictures.

For the materials or the contents which explained in books two, there are more than one, which is different with the book one that only focus on various kinds of texts as its main materials. The materials which comes up from each chapters in book two usually discuss about two or three main materials. All chapters explained about the structure of sentence or various kind of sentences and some expressions on its material. Some chapters include another explanations of materials such a specific kinds of text. Here are some examples of material content in book two based on the research findings.

As for worksheets, there only some of it contains critical aspects, and the kinds of activity which including critical thinking on it is HOTS corner and portofolio, where this worksheet is in form of answering some questions which happens to be popular at the moment or do something which can be useful for school environment.

The same as material book one which use Paul and Elder characteristic list of critical thinking to expand the explanation from point KI-3 and KI-4 on lesson plans, this book also contained those characteristics. However, there are three characteristics that can be find on all activities in this book, which the explanation provide some experts’ statement related to critical thinking.

First, Students asked to draw warranted conclusions and generalizations from the dialogue. As what stated by Michael Scriven & Richard Paul in 1987, Critical thinking is the intellectually disciplined process of actively and skillfully conceptualizing, applying, analyzing, synthesizing and evaluating information gathered from, or generated by, observation, experience, reflection, reasoning, or communication, as a guide to belief and action. So, the characteristic elements of the activity to draw conclusion and generalization such as answering questions related to some situations given for students in this book is in accordance with the definition from expert.

Second, the activity help students to be able to interpret data, to appraise evidence and evaluate arguments. The activity such as answering questions, language use contents, expressions and sentences are kinds of activity with critical thinking elements. This characteristic supported by Glaser in 1941 who defines critical thinking as the ability to think critically, as conceived in this volume, involves three things: (1) an attitude of being disposed to consider in a thoughtful way the problems and subjects that come within the range of one's experiences, (2) knowledge of the methods of logical inquiry and reasoning, and (3) some skill in applying those methods. The characteristics listed by Paul and Elder in accordance with Glaser definition about critical thinking, can be found integrates with the activities provided in this book.

Third, students gather information from materials then make a relevant information on their own. This characteristic also stated by Paul and Elder and Glaser, which it reflected on some activities such as warm up questions, language use and expressions to gather information before students make relevant information on their own. By making a relevant information, students able to master one of 4Cs skill, which is critical thinking.

To conclude, the activities provided in this book have critical thinking aspect on it and those characteristic help students to be able to think critically about English materials that explained in this book. This also prove that material books also consider KI-3 and KI-4 as the aspect provided on the book.

Creativity in this book can be found not only on the worksheet, but also on pre-activity and contents. The kinds of pre-activity which has creativity aspects is answering, while for the contents its from the explanation of sentence's structure or various kinds of sentences and as for worksheets, it comes up on completing text or dialogue with the right words or expressions, making a text, answering questions about or do something meaningful related to the materials they learn.

In this books, all of activities such as pre-activity, contents and worksheets has creativity on it, which are same with Bahasa Inggris material book. For pre-activity, which all of chapters provide a questions after observing picture, map, table or text, in accordance with characteristic of creativity stated by Guilford, which is produce great number of ideas or problem solutions in a short period of time. Since it is pre-activity, students should be able to solve the problems or produce new idea in short period of time and make them able to think creatively.

As for the content, the explanation of the contents, which the component of the main material are diverse than "Bahasa Inggris" book help students to produce more original ideas by collecting the important data from it as to complete the previous ideas they conduct in pre-activity.

For worksheets, There are some worksheets which requires students to produce new idea, such as how to respond an expressions by completing a dialogue, make or correct a sentences based on the structure of the sentences they learn in material contents, and HOTS corner which demand students to give an opinion and suggestion about something. As what stated in core competency four that student should be able to think creatively, HOTS corner provide it clearly by relate some questions with popular issues around students or something involved in daily life.

Beside HOTS corner and making text, dialogue or fill in the blank, another kinds of worksheet provided in this book which represent clearly the characteristics of creativity is a worksheet called portfolio. In portfolio worksheet, students usually asked to make something or conduct a research and students are free to carry out their ideas, which develop students to learn in creative way.

Based on the research findings supported with expert statement about a good textbook materials, the material book two has more 4Cs aspects on it than material book one. To compare the percentage between the similarity and the difference of critical thinking and creativity, As the percentage of the similarity of 4Cs that show up between two material books is 80% of 100%, while the similarity on the kind of activities which containing 4Cs skills has a percentage 40% of 100%. As for the difference, 4Cs

Skills difference between two books are 25% of 100 percent while the activities differences are 40% of 100 %.

CONCLUSION

Based on the research findings, it clearly shows that both books in practice have showed attempts to interpret 4Cs from theory into practice which indicates that the books try to fulfill the demand of the governments' policy as well as the skill needed in 21st century. Both material books have inserted 4Cs skill aspects on some parts of each chapter. As for both material book, both English textbooks have the same composition's pattern of the activities, such as: pre-activity, contents and worksheets. Both of critical thinking and creativity aspects mostly can be found in pre-activities and contents while communicative and collaborative skill commonly found in worksheets part of both books. The examples of activity for critical thinking aspect is reading a text or dialogue, while creativity is making dialogue, a text, a correcting sentences or choosing the correct expressions or sentences.

Another result findings to answer the second research question is English textbook two has more 4Cs elements on it than English textbook one. It proved by the similarity and differences of both textbooks that explains on how the 4Cs represented on each books has relation with the kinds of activities each books have. Kinds of activity differences, according to the result of research, which represent as percentage, shows that the similarity of critical thinking and creativity as 4Cs elements that show up between two material books is 80% of 100%, while the similarity on the kind of activities which containing 4Cs skills has a percentage 40% of 100%. As for the difference, 4Cs skills difference between two books are 20% of 100% while the activities differences are 60% of 100 %. So, the effectiveness of activities which help students to draw out their skills has a relation with the more various kinds of activities in an English Textbooks.

REFERENCES

- Ainunningsih, P.A. 2018. *An Analysis Of 4Cs Skills Incorporation In Students' Teaching Practice Of English Teacher Education Department UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya*, Sunan Ampel University.
- Ajideh, P. (2006). Schema-theory based considerations on pre-reading activities in ESP textbooks. *The Asian EFL Journal*, 16, 1-19. Retrieved December 10, 2013, from http://asian-efljournal.com/November_2006_Vol16_Art2.pdf
- Boston Center for Curriculum Redesign. 2015. *Massachusetts Skills for the 21st Century: What Should Students Learn?* (Center for Curriculum Redesign)
- Chami.H, (2020). *Reframing Education*. Dar Al Kalam : Beirut. Lebanon
- Davies, M. (2013). Critical thinking and disciplines reconsidered. *Higher Education Research and Development*, 32(4), 529–544.
- Fryeri,W. 2005. *The Digital Face of 21 –Century Curriculum*. (i.e. educators)
- Glaser, E.M. 1941. *An Experiment in the Development of Critical Thinking*. TeachersCollege, Columbia University.
- Guilford,J.P. 1950. Characteristics of Creativity. Available from:<http://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED080171>
- Hançerlioğlu, O. (1996). *Felsefe Sözlüğü*. İstanbul: Remzi Ktabevi:31.
- Harmer, J. 2007. *The Changing World of English*. In the Practice of English Language

- Teaching. UK: Cambridge.
- Harshbarger, R. 2016. *Learning in the 21st century : a study addressing Educational Trends and Implication*, University of central Florida
- Hendrayana, A.2013. *Teaching and Learning Models in Curriculum*
<http://alumnivandeventer.org/teaching-and-learning-models-in-curriculum-2013/>
- Iakovos and Tsiplakide. 2011. *Content-based Instruction in the Teaching of English as a Foreign Language at*
https://www.researchgate.net/publication/279488625_Content-based_Instruction_in_the_Teaching_of_English_as_a_Foreign_Language
- Kids on the Coast. 2017. *The Four Cs. Creativity in the 21st century classroom:*
<https://www.kidsonthecoast.com.au/read/education/article/the-four-cs-creativity-in-the-21st-century-classroom>
- Kisiel, J. F. (2003). Teachers, museums and worksheets: A closer look at a learning experience. *Journal of Science Teacher Education*, 14(1), 3–21.
- McDowell, E. T., & Waddling, R. E. L. (1985). Improving the design of laboratory worksheets. *Journal of Chemical Education*, 62(11), 1037–1038.
- McGregor Debra (2007). *Developing Thinking, Developing Learning*. Open University Press, pg.9
- Murti, Kuntari Eri.(2008). *Pendidikan abad 21 dan Implementasinya pada Pembelajaran di Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan (SMK) untuk paket keahlian desain interior: Widyaswra Madya*
- P21 . 2010. *Framework for 21st Century Learning* (released by Battle for kids). :
<http://wmww.p21.org/our-work/p21-framework>
- Paul, R. & Elder, L. (2008). *Critical thinking: tools for taking charge of your learning and your life*. Pearson/Prentice Hall.
- Penny Ur. 2009. *A Course in language Teaching*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press)
- Scriven, M., & Paul, R. (1987). *A statement presented at the 8th Annual International Conference on Critical Thinking and Education Reform, summer 1987*. Retrieved October 8, 2019 from [//www.criticalthinking.org/pages/defining-critical-thinking/766](http://www.criticalthinking.org/pages/defining-critical-thinking/766).
- Scott, Cynthia Luna. 2015. *Education Research and Foresight Working Papers*. (UNESCO)
- Sharma, M. & eElbow, Gary S. (2000). *Using Internet Primary Sources to Teach Critical Thinking Skills in Geography*. Greenwood Publishing Group, Incorporated.
- Torrance, E. P. 1962. *Guiding creative talent*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Vacca, R. T., & Vacca, J.L. (1989). *Content area reading* (3rd ed.). New York: Harpe Collins Publishers.
- Yulianti, R. 2011. *Content Analysis on the English E-book “Developing English Competencies for Senior High School (SMA/MA) Grade X”*. Unpublished Thesis. Malang: Faculty of Letters States.

