

WOMEN LEADERSHIP IN OPTICS FEMINIST INTERPRETATION



Muhammad As'ad

Pascasarjana UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya
Email: asad.safar99@gmail.com

Nasikhoh Haromain

Pascasarjana UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya
Email: nasihmansuh@gmail.com

Bustanun Niam

Pascasarjana UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya
Email: bustanunniam804@gmail.com

Abstract

This paper tries to make a discussion about women leadership perspective feminist interpretation. As is known, women leadership status until now is still invite a polemic moreover for muasir-academis circles. On one side, there is a opinion that classic interpretation model about gender is considered irrilevent more with modern context. Because term of obscurity gender more take sides to men. And than in other side, movers feminist exaggerating in interpret many verses al-Qur'an for supporting their opinion. In al-Qur'an, the verse that always made reference when discussing about gender is QS. al-Nisā' [4]: 34. This verse is considered as amplifier by many people that leadership must be in hand men. But is that true that the important message in this verse as like it ? are role women restricted in political realm ? Must be recognized that al-Qur'an (QS. al-Naml [27]: 20-44) has told about Queen Bilqis, she is woman phenomenal leader who succes changing Saba' country become a prosperous country. In QS. al-Nisā'[4]: 34 and al-Naml [27]: 20-44 look contradicting, but actually not like that because each of these two verses tell different context. Irrespectively of many argument for movers feminism, discuss more about women leadership in their opinion is so interesting. At least, this paper attend for stopping long debate between twu stronghold, between patriachism and feminism that have not find clarity.

Keywords: *Women Leadership, Feminist Interpretation, Q.S. al-Nisā'[4]: 34, Queen Bilqis.*

Abstrak

Tulisan ini mencoba menghadirkan diskusi mengenai kepemimpinan perempuan dalam perspektif tafsir feminis. Sebagaimana lazim diketahui, status kepemimpinan perempuan sampai detik ini masih mengundang polemik khususnya bagi kalangan mufasir-akademisi. Di satu sisi, ada pandangan bahwa model penafsiran klasik tentang masalah gender dianggap tidak relevan lagi dengan konteks modern, lantaran sarat akan bias-bias gender yang lebih memihak pada kaum laki-laki. Lalu di sisi lain, para pengusung gerakan feminis juga terlalu berlebihan dalam menafsirkan beberapa ayat al-Quran untuk menguatkan pandangan mereka. Dalam al-Qur'an, ayat yang sering dijadikan rujukan ketika membahas wacana seputar gender ini adalah QS. al-Nisā' [4]: 34. Sepenggal ayat ini oleh beberapa orang dianggap sebagai penegas bahwa kepemimpinan harus berada di tangan laki-laki. Namun, apakah benar pesan penting dari ayat ini memang seperti itu? Apakah perempuan dibatasi perannya dalam kancah politik? Harus diakui bahwa al-Qur'an (QS. al-Naml [27]: 20-44) sendiri telah menceritakan tentang Ratu Bilqis, seorang pemimpin perempuan fenomenal yang sukses menyulap negeri Saba' menjadi negeri yang makmur. Sepintas, QS. al-Nisā' [4]: 34 dan QS. al-Naml [27]: 20-44 terlihat bertentangan, tetapi sesungguhnya tidak demikian karena masing-masing dari kedua ayat ini berbicara pada konteks yang jelas berbeda. Terlepas dari berbagai tuduhan yang dialamatkan kepada pengusung gerakan feminisme, membahas lebih jauh mengenai kepemimpinan perempuan dalam pandangan mereka sangat menarik. Paling tidak, tulisan ini hadir untuk menyudahi perdebatan panjang antara dua kubu, antara patriarkisme dan feminisme yang belum menemukan titik terang.

Kata Kunci: Kepemimpinan Perempuan, Tafsir Femenis, QS. al-Nisā' [4]: 34, Ratu Bilqis.

INTRODUCTION

The women status in Islam until now still become interesting issue and invite polemic in various circles from *ulamā'*, *mufassir*, academician moreover in circle young people. The fact of historical that almost every muslim history, every men are in *superior* position, and for women always placed in *inferior*

position, and this problem known by paradigm *patriarchy*.¹ QS. al-Nisā' [4]: 34 is often made reference and theorem that leadership and obligation must be in the men of hands. can't be denied that that verse (and all of interpretation) become potent justification for subordinating women role in life.

The consequensi of it, women are perceived as the second class human in social reality. In that verse indicates that scope of family leadership is just mandated to men and this is one of privilege that given by Allah SWT. to men and won't never replaced by women, whatever condition of men, a leadership constantly in the men of hands in the family realm. But that verse is created theorem by ulama salaf for forbidding women become as a leader in public area moreover politic realm, and ulama salaf's opinion this thing discriminates women by use that verse, so that this verse become a obscurity gender.

Moreover there is a Ḥadīth of prophet which meaning is "*people will never lucky who give affairs (leadership) to women*" The sentence often taken as Ḥadīth also affirm women position as second class human, and the implication is men are worthy of hold a matter. Phenomenon about women in this modern era, women have appeared become a leader with different important occupation in public society or domestic society. So that, they demand for equal gender. Because all this time Islamic law thought, neither be found in the classic book of fiqh nor in the classic tafsir explain unjustice gender. The origin of islamic law thought is many inner contradiction between purpose of syari'ah and social norm muslim society cultur.²

Must be recognized that al-Qur'an (QS. al-Naml [27]: 20-44) has told about Queen Bilqis, she is woman phenomenal leader who succes changing Saba' country become a prosperous country. In QS. al-Nisā'[4]: 34 and al-Naml [27]: 20-44 look contradicting, but actually not like that because each of these two verses tell different context. Irrespectively of many argument for movers feminism, discuss more about women leadership in their opinion is so interesting. At least, this paper attend for stopping long debate between twu stronghold, between patriarchy and feminism that have not find clarity. Because of this background, writer interested in researching further about *women leadership* in islam throught interpretation with approaching feminism so that, this comprehensive understanding finally will decrease big mistakes when apply a teks or sentences.

¹ Zaitunah Subhan, *Tafsir Kebencian Studi Bias Gender Dalam Tafsir Qur'an* (Yogyakarta: LKiS, 1999), 18-19

² Zaprul Khan, "Rekonstruksi Peran Politik Perempuan Menurut Musda Mulia" dalam *Jurnal Pemikiran Islam* (2015): 315.

DISCUSSION

Feminist Interpretation: Movement and Discourse

Women leadership is very related with feminisme issue that developing in westren. The issue is one of issues that was born from modernism.³ Etymologically 'feminisme' derived from a latin word, that is '*femina*' in english it is translated '*femine*' which meaning is *has traits of female*. That word there is a word 'isme', so that become a comprehension, that is a comprehension which invited gender issues and relate with women fate haven't gotten fairly sundry sector of life, neither domestic, politic, social, economi nor education. The first Movement feminism known in 1895.⁴ And termenologically many opinions about feminism. One of them is a awareness to oppression and extortion to women in public society at workpalce and in the family, and aware action w omen or men for change the situation.⁵

In history, movement feminism born with *renaissance* coincidly in Italy and bring a change and make awareness in europe, in that time The humanist encourage individual freedom, neither women nor men, from retraining sciene that done by side of church. The result of that movement born science revolution in XVII century and encourage the birth of liberalism and culminate france revolution in the end of XVII century. And thenThis revolution born too big change in social politic, include the society mindset in that time. A long with it born a awarenees women for fight their rights that all this time marginalized, pioneered by Mary Wollstroneccraft in England, throught her creation *A Vindication of The Right of Women* on 1792.⁶ In the progress, the feminism arrive in America on end of 19th century and early of 21st century. Strating poin from this movement is fighting for the right to vote. But after the right was reached, this movement spread increasingly and ever experience different tought when affected by *masculine* method of thinking. A aggressive movement and oppress back to men. They are tend to *chauvinistic*.⁷ In indonesia the feminism movement is developing for about 1980. Some activists appear as like Hermawati, Wardah Hafidz, Marwah Daud Ibrahim, Yulia Surya Kusuma, Ratna Megawangi.⁸

³ Muḥammad 'Imārah, *Tahrīr al-Mar'ah bayna al-Gharbi wa al-Islām* (Kairo: Maktabah Imām al-Bukhārī, 2009), 14.

⁴ Abdul Mustaqim, *Paradigma Tafsir Feminis, Membaca Al-Quran Dengan Optik Perempuan* (Yogyakarta: Logung Pustaka, 2008), 85.

⁵ Kamla Bashin dan Nighat Said Khan, *Persoalan Pokok Mengenai Feminisme dan Relevansinya*, Terj. S. Harlina (Jakarta: Gramedia, 1995), 4

⁶ Fatimah Mernissi, *Wanita di Dalam Islam*, (terj.) Yaziar Radiant (Bandung: Pustaka, 1991), vii.

⁷ Abdul Mustaqim, *Paradiqma Tafsir Feminis*, 91.

⁸ Abdul Mustaqim, *Paradiqma Tafsir Feminis*, 92.

In progress until now, activity of neither feminism nor gender activator is different between country and respective culture setting and the ism in fighting for movement feminism also experience interpretation and different suppression in many places. Feminism in Italia more focus in equality roles for strive social services, and the rights of women as mother, wife and worker. The same thing pioneered by feminist in Indonesia that emulated from movement RA. Kartini, Dewi Sartika, Cut Nya' Dien. By spirit of feminism, so that appear many ideas and study of the interpretation of verse al-Qur'ān and Ḥadīth that done by muslim intellectuals, and known by designation muslim feminist.⁹ The emergence of ideas and that study are appropriate by the spirit of thelogy muslim feminism which guarantee Islam aligns to integrity and authority humanity of women and distorted by big narrations classic Islamic discourse for now still dominate the socialization proess and islamic contemporary learning.¹⁰ And moreover in interpretation realm.

As like feminist movement, feminist interpretation born is not much different because affected by things that have internal and external character. Like amount of men *mufassir* more dominant than women *mufassir*, so that a book of interpretation is dominated comes from thought of men brain until a women problem and views of women use views of men. This prblem causes refraction opinon about men and women. There is a difference between Qur'ān normative-idealist learning and it's interpretation to normative-historis level.¹¹ As like told by Baroroh,¹² that there are two focus research in muslim feminist for fighting for a gender equality. The first, inequality between men and women in public society structure isn't appear from existing Islam. But appear in men refraction understanding and because of it become a standard islamic learning. The second for reaching a equality need a study

⁹ Wiyatmi, *Konstruksi Gender dalam Novel Geni Jora Karya Abidah El-Khalieqy*, 200

¹⁰ Siti Ruhaini Dzuhayatin, dkk. *Rekonstruksi Metodologis Wacana Kesetaraan Gender dalam Islam*, 22

¹¹ Normative teachings of Qur'ān strickly presume that men and women are equal in front of Allah, because men and women are created for know each other, and human glory is not judgen by gender, but judged by their piety to Allah. Men and women are same and equalized with clothing. Both of them must protecting each other and complement each other to their deficiency (Q.S al-Baqarah [2]:187). Men and woman who have faith and have good deeds achivement will get heaven guarantee (Q.S. al-Nisā' [4]:124). Allah SWT also grant request for appreciating work performance and not wasting their good deeds (Q.S. Āli 'Imrān [3]:195). Moreover men and women mentioned and praised with good character. They are promised getting forgiveness and great reward. (Q.S. al-Aḥzāb [33]: 35).

¹² Umul Baroroh, *Feminisme dan Feminis Muslim, dalam Pemahaman Islam dan Tantangan Keadilan Gender*, ed. Sri Suhandjati (Yogyakarta: Pusat Studi Gender IAIN Walisongo dan Gama Media, 2002), 201.

more to sources of Islamic learning that associated with gender relations and cass of basic learning principles. That is justice and degree equality.

The contemporary feminist *mufassir*, as like Riffat Hasan, Fatima mernissi, Amina Wadud, Asghar Ali Engineer, here just mention a little figure, agree that many interpetations that dominated patriarchy ideology pradigm, give contribution for restriction of women. Mostly the classic *mufassir* are men, so that they aren't aware that they less in accomodating women importance. Fair if one day interpretations that produced still available and reflect patriarchy refraction, moreover when being read in context now.

The Leadership Style of Men and Women: Reading The Story of Queen Bilqis

In general, leadership is the ability that owned by an individual so that can affect, encourage, move others people in order that can do something for reaching speific destinition. Leadership derived from word leader, in English leadership named by *leadership* derived from word *leader* from root of word *to lead* which the meaning is moving earlier, walking in early, taking a early step, doing something first, spearheading, guiding, directing the mind or other people opinion, and moving other people through their effect. Leadership can definitioned as a complex process where a leader give effect to their subordinates when doing and reaching vision, mission, and duty, or a objetive something that because of it bring the organization more progressive and being uinte. A leader does this process by applying the traits of themselves that is confidence, worth, temperament, knowladge and finesse that owned.¹³

KH. Abdur Rohman Wahid and usually known with calling Gus Dur dosen't refuse a possibility a woman become a country leader. His opinion success or unsucess women become a leader is so depend on men acceptance that become their subordinate, is he ready cooperation under their command or no?. He said also that cleric's opinion that said women are weaker than men so that women can not become a leader it is not accordance with fact the historical facts, in the fact, many success countries in women hand as like Cleopatra, Ratu Balqis, Corie Aquino, Margaret Theatcher and Benazir Butho. Even he also admit abilities of Megawati Soekarno Putri when become a leader. Megawati has intelligence and offspring form her father Soekarno, this is become a basis why she will become a leader in the future.¹⁴ This short story will be interesting if related with women leadership in Islam where the majority of Indonesian population is Islam.

¹³ Bass, B. M. *Handbook of leadership: Theory, research & managerial applications* (3rd Ed) (New York: The Free Press, 1990).

¹⁴ M. N Ibad, *Perempuan dalam perjuangan Gus Dur-Gus Mick* (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pesantren, 2011), 101-102.

In study of interpretation studies that connected by scientific interpretation find many viewpoints which relevanter for getting titik temu. In difference of individual or group based on “behavior” involve a induce a problem that related by value of a women in society and value of a women as individu. Although the Qur’ān give difference based on good attitude, the Qur’ān doesn’t construct value device for certain behavior. This matter make every social system determine different behavior value. Every social system usually do it and every society have made a difference between job of men and job of women. Various *stereotyping* to women, as like emosional character, irasional, *irrevocably feminine*, and *congenitally subordinate*, appear vertical segregation that marked by domination of men in top organization position.

Many developing perspective about how to manage aspect gender in organization. Among others are *Liberal Feminism*¹⁵ and approach gender in management. In perspective *Gender in management* more rational. The basic assumption is men and women socializing differently, because of it they manage organization differently also. So that, that perspective try give the identification a feedback between gender and practice management by learn important characteristic in work managerial, style of leadership that applied by men and women, and the consequence of practice organizational and managerial, in other words, the main focus is how people neither men nor women manage organization actually.¹⁶ In relation with leadership, masculine characteristic socialized by transactional leadership or administrative style, while *feminine* characteristic related by transformational leadership or changed oriented style.¹⁷

In surah al-Naml (QS. al-Naml [27]: 20-44) told that Bilqis is a queen that lead a prosperous kingdom (Saba’ country). And also told in other verse that in leading, Bilqis use wise principles of democracy. She always discussion with her government officials for deciding statehood problems, so that they believe in Bilqis decision entirely. Leadership attitude and Bilqis intelligency seen when she does negotiation with prophet Sulaiman. With her dogdy when make diplomacy finally Bilqis decide that she faith to prophet

¹⁵ Feminist liberal approach rate that menand women have same position and same level in every field. So that women have same capability with men for fulfill every work requirements as like head master. Feminism libral identify there is “glass ceiling” phenomenon in modern organisation. The phenomenon is implicit obstacle and invisible but very difficult to penetrated, but can prevent women opportunity for get senior position or top management in organisation. 15 Look: Brown, *Women Organising* (London: Routledge, 1992), 23-24.

¹⁶ B. Alimo Metcalfe, “An Investigation of Female and Male Constructs Of Leadership and Empowerment,” in *Women in Management Review* Vol. 10, 2 (1995):

¹⁷ Gherardi, *Gender, Symbolism, and Organizational Cultures* (London: Sage, 1995), 56-57.

Sulaiman and followed by her folk.¹⁸ Thus Qur'an tells the figure of Bilqis, a ideal leader,¹⁹ as proof that women can have brilliant thought,²⁰ brave to take against decision with trend but by way of invite appreciation. However this advantages don't make her being arrogant, even she wants to listen and receive prophet Sulaiman's da'wah for leaving worship idols, and than she believe in Allah.²¹

In KH. Husain Muhammad opinion, leadership success of Bilqis because of she can manage her public by her attitude and her democratic mind. Aside from Bilqis, there are many women leaders in modrn era their leadership being success.²² The group that prohibit women become the highest leader of the country opine that story of queen Bilqis can not created a basic of permissibility women become a leader, because these verses just in framework of story (*Hikāyah*) not in framework of law legalization (*tashrī*).²³

And then story of Bint Kisra in Ḥadīth Abū Bakrah, in *Fath al-Bār*²⁴ we get the explanation about Ḥadīth that become main theorem in majority of *fuqahā'* for prohibiting women become leader of the country. That Ḥadīth is Abū Bakrah's Ḥadīth that *sanad* and *matan* rated *ṣahīh*, because the Ḥadīth there is in *ṣahīh Bukhari* labeled the second source of Islamic law after Qur'an. In it's sarah, Ibnu Hajar give opinion the Ḥadīth "*lan yufliha al-qawmu wallā amrahum imra'ah*" is continuation from Bintu Kisra's respon to prophet Muhammad through letter she sent. The meaning of Ḥadīth above must be related with *sabāb al-wurūd*, that is inducted Buran purti Syiruyah putra Kisra ascend the throne changed his father become queen democratically. Rasulullah's statement that threaten clan who make women as leader with unhappiness. Because look at how to theologian connect story of QS. al-Naml (QS. al-Naml [27]: 20-44) with Abū Bakrah's Ḥadīth ?

¹⁸ Lihat Abi 'Abdillāh bin Aḥmad bin Muḥammad al-Qurṭūbī, *al-Jamī' li Aḥkām al-Qur'an* (Beirut: Dār Kutub al-'Ilmiyah, 1998), 170-198, Sayyid Qutb, *Tafsīr fi Zilāl al-Qur'an* (Beirut: Dār al Kutub al-'Ilmiyah, 1997), 2640-2643, Muḥammad 'Izzah Darwazah, *al-Tafsīr al-Ḥadīth* (Beirut: Dar al Gharb al-Islami, 2000), 290. al-Zamakhsharī, *al-Kashshāf* (Beirut: Dar al-Fikr, 1998), 147.

¹⁹ Muḥammad 'Alī Ṣabunī, *Safwah al-Tafāsir* (Beirut: Dār al Fikr, 2001), juz III.

²⁰ Sayyid Qutb, *Tafsīr fi Zilāl al-Qur'an* (Beirut: Dār al Kutub al-'Ilmiyah, 1997), 2640-2643.

²¹ Tahir Ibn 'Ashur, *al - Tahrir wa al - Tanwir* (Tunisia: al-Dar al-Tunisiyyah li al-Nashr, 1984), juz. I, 277.

²² Huscin Muhammad, *Fiqh Perempuan: Refleksi Kiai terhadap Wacana Agama dan Gender* (Bantul: LKiS Yogyakarta. 2012)

²³ Mhuammad 'Izzah in his al-Hadith interpretation said; that Bilqis government system that prefer deliberation and Bilqis more choosing diplomacy than war that become mainstay her clan in self defense, even delivered in history but there is no intent than Al-Qur'an invitation for learn it.

²⁴ Ahmad bin Ali bin Hajar al-Asqalani, *Fath al - Bari Sharh Sahih al - Bukhari* (Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-Ilmiyah, 1989), Juz VIII, 739-741.

In the interpretation, Qurṭubī reraed Abū Bakrah's Ḥadīth then followed by Ibn 'Arabī comment that based on this Ḥadīth theologian agreed that women are not corrected become leader of country. Even Qurṭubī look for way for interpret Tabari and Abū Ḥanīfah opinion who allow the women become a judge.²⁵ Likewise Imam Al-Baghāwī, after told how to Bilqis get her power, he reread Abū Bakrah Ḥadīth without give coment. As if give indication that surah al-Naml is deleted by Abū Bakrah Ḥadīth.²⁶ The main point is the clasic theologian agreed that intended of *imra'ah* in Ḥadīth is not only Bint Kisra but also women ingenerally, and intended of *qawm* is general include clan that led by women. Likewise the majority of contemporary theologian give political rights to women, except lead the country through this Ḥadīth.

However many cotemporary theologian who have other interpretation. Concern Ḥadīth above, Hibbah Rauf Izzat said that this Ḥadīth understood and confirmed to story about Persia and Kisra. Because this Ḥadīth said by Prophet Muhammad in certain event context, that is the Persian have appointed Kisra daughter as their queen.²⁷ Al-Qarḍawī opinion, Abū Bakrah Ḥadīth must be understood by use kaidah which offered by Ibn 'Abbās. Because if we use kaidah *al-'ibrah bi 'umūm al-lafzi lā bi khuṣūṣ al-sabab*, so will happen contradiction between Abū Bakrah Ḥadīth with Qur'an that tell Queen Bilqis success story, a woman leader who lead her folk wisely, lead them to success in the word and hereafter.²⁸ Even Muhammad 'Imarah²⁹ assert that although history side, Abū Bakrah Ḥadīth can not doubted, but in substance side we must understand that this Ḥadīth closer to political prediction than a low legitimacy.

Fatimah Mernissi, she is feminist figure from Maroko, can't receive that Ḥadīth as *hujjah*, because the Ḥadīth regarded contradict with the Qur'an which give idea women can become leader of country and can bring their folk to prosperous, peaceful life. Mernissi cite Shaikh Muhammad al-Ghazali, she said Ḥadīth that prohibit women have position as leader of country is contradict with ayat of Qur'an wich tell about Queen Sheba (Bilqis), "I found a woman who has power to them, and she awarded overflow something and

²⁵ al-Qurṭubī, *al-Jamī' li Aḥkām al-Qur'ān*, 171

²⁶ Al-Baghawi, *Ma'ālim at Tanzīl fī at Tafsīr wa at Ta'wīl* (Beirut: Dār al Fikr, 2002), 173-174.

²⁷ Hibbah Rauf Izzat, *al-Mar'ah wa al-'Amal al-Siyāsī Ru'yah Islamiyyah*, diterjemahkan oleh Baharuddin al-Fanani dengan judul Wanita dan Politik Pandangan Islam (Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya, 1997), 108.

²⁸ Yusuf al-Qardawi, *Min Fiqh al-Dawlah fī al-Islām* (Cairo: Dār al-Shurūq, 1997), 174-176.

²⁹ Muhammad 'Imarah, *al-Tahrīr al-Islāmī fī al-Mar'ah* (Cairo: Dār al-Shurūq, 2002), 103-104.

her throne is a great throne.”³⁰ Mernissi asserted that Qur’ān is the holy kitab which based on revelation. So that it is more superior if compared by any Ḥadīth. As a result in this case, every Ḥadīth which againts women rights for ruling considered outdated, ancient and not used again because of the verse explain wisdom about Queen Sheba.³¹

Mernissi agreed also with al-Ghazālī said he was surprised at “blindness” every religious leaders in example which are in Qur’ān. In the Qur’ān is told obviously that a women leader who has used decision and good consideration and reign folk wisely and achieve many success. So that the problem is not about gender, or the leaders are men or women, but depend on the ability they have in creating a justice, creating human rights and their ability for creating democratic life.³² So that there is no different between men and women, they can become reach top leader as leader of country, provided *credible* and *capable*. From exposure above, the writer agreed that for choosing a leader is not depend on men or women, because text of Qur’ān has explained to us obviously that men or women don’t become measurement the clan or the country. Saba’ is led by woman succeed become a prosperous country in the word and hereafter, otherwise Fir’aun, bring his folk to destruction. The measure from men and women is worthiness and ability (aspect of *’aqīdah*, morals, knowledge) and government system use institution with the principle of deliberation or tyrannical centralized.

Women Leadership in Optics Feminist Interpretation

The position of men (husband) in household actually is the respon to Arab social society condition when al-Qur’ān lowered. In this metter role of men dominate areas of life include family system. In Arab society men is in charge defend and maintain all of family members, responsible fulfill all of family members needs, the consequences of men is dominate leadership in all level. In QS. al-Nisā’ [4]: 34:

الرِّجَالُ قَوَّامُونَ عَلَى النِّسَاءِ بِمَا فَضَّلَ اللَّهُ بَعْضَهُمْ عَلَى بَعْضٍ وَبِمَا أَنْفَقُوا مِنْ أَمْوَالِهِمْ

“Men are in charge of women, because Allah hath made the one of them to excel the other, and because they spend of their property (for the support of women).”

³⁰ Departemen Agama RI, *Al-Quran dan Terjemahnya* (Jakarta: CV Indah Press, 2002), 435

³¹ Fatimah mernissi, *Beyond The feil:Male-female Dinamic in Modern Muslim Society* (Indiana: Indiana University Press, 1987), 204

³² Fatimah mernissi, *Beyond The feil:Male-female Dinamic in Modern Muslim Society*, 216

This verse must be understood comprehensively and not piece by piece because in this verse there is a sentence further that is “because men have supported part of their property.” بما فضل الله بعضهم على بعض وبما انفقوا من اموالهم indicate that the point is “leadership in family (household) and that standard which given to men.”³³ such as asserted in QS. Al-Baqarah [2]: 228:

وَهُنَّ مِثْلُ الَّذِي عَلَيْهِنَّ بِالْمَعْرُوفِ ۗ وَلِلرِّجَالِ عَلَيْهِنَّ دَرَجَةٌ

“..the women have equal right with her obligation according to the way *ma'ruf* but the husband has one level advantages than his wife...”³⁴

The verse above Rashid Rida opinion is general *qā'idah* that explain about equal position between men and women in every field except in leadership problem in household.³⁵ Besides that, verse above implied indicate that by nature, “men tend want to protect women”³⁶ in other word that meaning of قَوَّامُونَ is many meaning obiter protector, guider, and adviser. Apparently mufassir and classic *fuqahā'* more inclined give meaning قَوَّامُونَ as leader than the others meaning. Even presume this verse indicate that men have obligation manage and educate women. But many *mufassir* and contemporary Islamic thinker presume that verse 34 surah al-Nisā' is not understood like that, moreover the verse explain in context household of life. Quraish Shihab opinion, that الرِّجَالُ قَوَّامُونَ عَلَى النِّسَاءِ not men in general but it is “husband” because consideration that command as like asserted in continuation the verse is *because they (the husband) spend part of their property for his wife*. If intended of “men” is men in general so the consideration not like it. Moreover continuation of the verse explain about the wife and life of household.³⁷

In many *tafsir* books, the writer read, the mufassir neither tafsir is written by *riwāyah* nor *al-ra'yi*. Understand “*qawwām*” with meaning leadership (*umarā'*). This meaning comes from Ibn 'Abbās interpretation.³⁸

³³ Yusuf al-Qardawi, *Hadyu al-Islām Fatāwī Mu'āsirah*, terj. As'ad Yasin dengan judul *Fatwa-Fatwa Kontemporer* (Jakarta: PT Gema Insani Press, 1996), Jilid 2, 528.

³⁴ Departemen Agama RI, *Al-Quran dan Terjemahnya*, 55.

³⁵ Muhammad Rashid Rida, *Tafsir al-Manār* (Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-Ilmiyyah, 1992) Juz II.

³⁶ Ratna Megawangi, *Membiarkan Berbeda Sudut Pandang Baru Tentang Relas Gender* (Bandung: Mizan, 1999), 195.

³⁷ M. Quraish Shihab, *Wawasan Al Quran Tafsir Maudhu'i atas Pelbagai Persoalan Umat* (Bandung: Mizan Pustaka, 2005), 314. Lihat pula Abi Abdillah bin Ahmad bin Muhammad al-Qurṭūbī, *al-Jamī' li Ahkām al-Qur'ān*, 290.

³⁸ Untuk tafsir *bi al-riwāyah*, lihat. Muhammad ibn Jarīr al-Ṭabarī, *Tafsir al-Ṭabarī Jamī' al-Bayān 'an Ta'wīl Ay al-Qur'ān* (Kairo: Markaz al-Buḥūth wa al-Dirāsāt al-'Arabīyyah wa al-Islāmiyyah, 2001 M/ 1422 H), ditahqiq oleh 'Abdullah ibn 'Abd al-Muhsin al-Turki, juz. VI, 687. Lihat, Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūṭi, *al-Dūr al-Mansūr fī al-Tafsir bi al-Ma'thūr* (Kairo: Markaz al-Buḥūth wa al-Dirāsāt al-'Arabīyyah wa al-Islāmiyyah, 1424 H/

The verse state that there are two factor that induce leadership is handled by men. The first is glory that given by Allah to men than women. The second, because they warrant living of women.³⁹ Until here, the theologian there no different in interpret the verse, they agreed that men become a leader than women. But is that leadership for all of men or no? in other word, is men become leader for women automatically or no caused 2 factor? In this problem there is difference. Al Zamakhsari said a whole of man become leader than women. This thing caused glory that given by Allah to men than women.

The second reason that created religious proposition that prohibit women become leader is prophet Muhammad SAW Ḥadīth which narrated by Abū Bakrah, that “a clan will not lucky who give their affairs to women” in this matter almost every fiqh expert prohibit involvement women as leader use this Ḥadīth as proposition. Lately they give boosters argumentation that women are senseless creature and unstable mentally. So the opportunity is closed for women for occupy top leader in every field that handle affairs many people.⁴⁰

Different with mufassir opinion in general, mufassir feminist as like Amina Waduh⁴¹ reject this verse if this verse interpreted as must men as leader of household. For them placing women as guided people is just concept of culture, not about *kodrati* (nature). Amina tries doing methodological reconstruction how to interpret al-Qur'an in order that can generate sensitive gender interpretations and give justice. The creation of Amina is proof of her intellectual anxiety about injustice *gender* in society. Amina tries doing reconstruction to classic interpretation with obscurity patriarchy. Amina opinion, al-Qur'an is source of the highest value regard appraise men and women fairly. So that command in al-Qur'an must be interpreted in specific history, it is condition when al-Qur'an lowered must be attentioned and also background of mufassir.⁴² Critic that showed by Amina in't to al-Qur'an and al-Sunnah but for legacy of classic interpretation.

2003 M), 384. Untuk *tafsīr bī al-ra'yi*. Lihat, Abū al-Qāsim Maḥmūd ibn 'Umar al-Zamakhsharī, *al-Kashshāf 'an Haqā'iq Gawāmid al-Tanzīl wa 'Uyūn al-Aqawī fī Wujūh al-Ta'wīl* (Riyad: Maktabah 'Abikan, 1998 M/1418 H), juz. II, 67.

³⁹ Muhammad ibn Jarīr al-Ṭabarī, *Tafsīr al-Ṭabarī Jami' al-Bayān 'an Ta'wīl Ay al-Qur'ān*, 690. Al-Zamakhshari, *al-Kashshāf 'an Haqā'iq Gawāmid al-Tanzīl wa 'Uyūn al-Aqawī fī Wujūh al-Ta'wīl*, juz. II, 67.

⁴⁰ Tim Redaksi Tanwir al-Afkar Ma'had 'Aly PP. Salafiyah Syafi'iah Situbondo, *Fiqh Rakyat Pertautan dengan Kekuasaan* (Yogyakarta: LKiS, 2000), 73.

⁴¹ Amina Wadud is one of feminist who try apply “equality gender” by reinterpret verses considered harm women. In her perspective, many Islamic law in this time applied in society Islam is the result of construction from men. Wadud wants to make new law construction in perspective and interests of women.

⁴² Abdul Mustaqim, *Amina Wadud: Menuju Keadilan Gender*, Dalam A. Kudri Shaleh (ed), *Pemikiran Islam Kontemporer* (Yogyakarta: Jendela, 2000), 66.

Amina opinion about verse above, men can be leader for women if men have two things; *the first*, husband can prove his advantages; *the second*, husband support women (his wife) by use their property. If that 2 things can not be fulfilled, so husband is not leader for his women (wife).⁴³ For the feminist, understanding that put husband as household leader isn't suitable even contradicting with feminist main idea, that is equality of men and women. So logical consequence from equal of men and women concept is there is equality between wife and husband. Referring to al-Rāzī interpretation that men (husband) becomes leader in household because he has advantage for giving living to his wife. But otherwise Amina opinion if husband can not give living to wife, so leader status is lost if now many women who work and become household leader, so interpretation of household leadership is change, it is Amina Wadud opinion.

Understanding intent of men leadership to women mentioned in verse above, Muḥammad 'Abduh opinion is leadership that has meaning *keeping, protecting, and sufficient wife needs*. As consequence of that leadership men get heritage more than women. Because men responsible bigger than women. Livelihood responsibilities, Abduh opinion it is not given to women. But important note given by Abduh shape leadership men to women is shape democratic leadership, leadership which give freedom for women for doing her aspiration, neither in choosing work nor her education.⁴⁴ Existence of women in household must be done well, with equal attitude so there is no obscurity that wife is lower than husband.

Interpretation done by Abduh about men leadership in household is accordance with Ashgar Ali Engineer and Amina Wadud understanding. They agreed that shape of men leadership to women is not as shape discrimination to women. Because the leadership is based on equality between rights and obligation. Engineer opinion, surah al-Nisā': 34 may not be understood freely from social context when the verse lowered. Engineer opinion social awareness in prophet Muhammad SAW. era isn't admit equal of men and women. In engineer opinion excellence of men than women isn't excellence gender, but excellence functional, because men (husband) look for living and expenditure his property for women (wife). Social function that carried by men same with carried by women, that is doing domestic obligation in household. Then when al-Qur'an tell excellence of men than women engineer opinion caused 2 things, the first is awareness women in that time is very low and domestic work presumed to women obligation, the second is men presume himself superior caused and power his ability to look for living and expend for

⁴³ Marwan Saridjo, *Cak Nur: di Antara Sarung dan Dasi dan Musdah Mulia Tetap Berjilbab* (Jakarta: Yayasan Ngali Aksara, 2005), 132.

⁴⁴ Muhammad Abduh dan Muhammad Rashid Rida, *Tafsīr al-Manār* (Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1992), 67.

women (wife) needs.⁴⁵ With that main, Engineer said that statement *al-rijālu qawwāmu'alā al-nisā'* is not normative statement, but contextual statement.⁴⁶

Same with Engineer, Rifat Hasan, one of feminism fighter, when interpret verse above "*qawwāmūna*" more to split functional task between men and women for keep balance in society. Men can not give birth so his task is looking for living. Women are not obliged looking for living in order to can maximum in other function it is productive. These 2 tasks is different but can not be separated between one and the other, but must complement and there's no higher or lower.⁴⁷ About different function between men and women, Amina said that al-Qur'an treat women same with treat men. The only difference is piety that not determined by gender. The main difference of role between men and women is women have ability to give birth. So that this isn't reason that women just can be a mother.⁴⁸ Amina addt that there is in al-Qur'an expression indicate give birth is the main thing for women. There is indication that being mother is absolute role for her.⁴⁹ There is only command for respect and liable to mother cause has given birth.⁵⁰

About difference level (*darājah*) given by Allah to human, that is more inclusive than level determined by human in the word. There is difference level between humans based on knowladge. In QS. Mujadalah [58]: 11:

يَرْفَعِ اللَّهُ الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا مِنْكُمْ وَالَّذِينَ أُوتُوا الْعِلْمَ دَرَجَاتٍ

As well as *faḍḍala* in Qur'an mention that Allah give advantages to some human than other human. Amina opinion this word same with *derajat* that this "advantages" isn't absolute. Although al-Qur'an state that some of messenger of Allah exaggerated than others, but al-Qur'an also state that there is no different among them (al-Baqarah [2]: 285). Amina opinion this is indicate that in Qur'an excrescent is always relative.⁵¹ But, different with *darājah*, *faḍḍala* can not be gotten by doing certain good deed. *Faḍḍala* only can be given by Allah to the people he want. Likewise in surah al-Nisā' verse 34. This verse encompass more than excrescent. Traditionally, this verse rated the only most important verse with relation between men and women: "men

⁴⁵ Asghar Ali Engineer, *Hak-Hak Perempuan Dalam Islam*, Terj. Farid Wajidi dan Cici Farkha Assegaf (Yogyakarta: LSPPA Yayasan Prakarsa, 1994), 61.

⁴⁶ Asghar Ali Engineer, *Hak-Hak Perempuan Dalam Islam*, 62.

⁴⁷ Riffat Hasan, *Perempuan Islam dan Islam Pasca Partiarshi'* dalam Fatima Marnissi dan Riffat Hasan, *Setara di Hadapan Allah*, Terj. Tim LSPPA (Yogyakarta: LSPPA, 1995), 92 disadur dari Dr. Abdull Mustaqim, *Paradiqma Tafsir Feminis*, 127.

⁴⁸ Riffat Hasan, *Perempuan Islam dan Islam Pasca Partiarshi'*, 110.

⁴⁹ Riffat Hasan, *Perempuan Islam dan Islam Pasca Partiarshi'*, 111.

⁵⁰ Abdull Mustaqim, "*Amina Wadud: Menuju*, 74.

⁵¹ Amina Wadud, *Qur'an*, 120.

qawwāmūna ala women” this verse assert that position between men and women determined by something that Allah given.⁵²

In general, there are 2 main assumption for giving interpretation to Islamic learning about women, group who give opinion that Islam differentiate men and women neither biologically nor gender. This difference of biological function will related with difference of function and women role. Some of islamic teaching utilized as base argumentation which give legitimation to men and women domination. If refer to clarification above, apparently the feminist figures Amina Wadud, Riffat Hasan, Fatimah Mernissi and Engineer including the second category, that rate there is no essential difference in Islam about men and women position. They agreed “*qawwāmūna*” more to split functional task between men and women. Form their judgement about general principle equal gender in Islam. They don’t agree if religion related with injustice practice that done by most of the muslims to women. Moreover position religion for legitimizing that practice. They have same judgement that muslims be responsible to emergence of assumptions above. Argumentation that delivered by them has similarity in Qur’ān review with normative and historical method, that is interpret al-Qur’ān with consider historical reality where the Qur’ān lowered, and aspect of moral ideal in Qur’ān than formal legal aspect.

From interpretation that delivered by feminist figures, besides there is similarity there is difference also. That I, if Riffat Hasan, Fatimah Mernissi and Engineer recognize men leadership to women in household because there is excellence given to men videlicet excellence functional without term, so Amina Wadud recognize men leadership to women in household but with term, that is men capable provide living his woman by property he has. Without capable give living to his woman so husband is not leader for women. This Amina Wadud thinking indicate interrelationship between privilege received by men with obligation he has. Reconstruction of thinking above is as respon to interpretation classic mufasssir. Writer agreed with KH. Husein Muhammad opinion, reality that happened now indirectly already “sacredness” past interpretation. The fact now, women have ability as owned by men. In other presumption, women is not only identic with emotional but also already can think rationally. Besides, since a long time ago many women leader that success become a leader.

The most essential thing in leadership with referring to leadership context is ability and intellectuality. Both of that thing now can be owned by everybody, neither men nor women, the point is neither men nor women have same opportunity for becoming a leader based on the judgment capability and intellectuality. And style of leadership is not always refer to concentration *gender*, can be a man practicing *femine* leadership not *masculine* or

⁵² Amina Wadud, *Qur’an*, 121

conversely. The idea which state that difference of gender become obstacle for leading can not defended because leadership is for mutual benefits.

Therefore, theorem that become refrence the classic *mufassir* who position women as the second class more subjective and relative. So less precise become justification to the difference. As like Shaikh Muḥammad ‘Abduh thinking thqt delivered by Muhammad Imrah that Shaikh Muḥammad ‘Abduh when interpret that verse tend understanding that rights of leading given to men with ability he has. But not mean that women don’t have opportunity for becoming leader. His opinion, women who have ability (*al-muḥallāt li riyāsah*) have same rights with men. In the meaning that men excellence is not *qudrati* (Allah’s provision) but subjective (cultural construction) that can change.

CONCLUSION

From all explanation which have written by writer above, so can be taken conclusion that the feminist figures have same vision and mission in equal gender problem in Islam. The women who were all this time assumed become victim injustice gender by theological basis must be saved. The important point that can we take from their thinkings they want to disassemble classic thinking or myth which caused by obscurity patriarchy interpretaton through reconstruction methodology of their interpretation. Because that is not balance with basic principle and spirit al-Qur’ān. al-Qur’ān is so fair in put men and women. But this thing become distorted by obscurity patriarchy interpretaton, moreover strengthened politic system in society that very patriarchy. Finally, feminism qur’ānī concept is place men and women to position complement each other and need each other. Relation of men and women is balance relationship and equality and justice. Equality and justice require, level equality, big and small are determined by propotional task respectively.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- ‘Abduh, Muhammad dan Muhammad Rashid Riḍā’. *Tafsīr al-Manār*. Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-Ilmiyyah, 1992.
- ‘Ashūr, Ṭāhir Ibn. *Al-Tahrīr wa al-Tanwīr*. Tunisia: al-Dār al-Tunīsiyyah li al-Nashr, 1984.
- Al-Athqalānī, Aḥmad bin Ali bin Ḥajar. *Al-Fath al-Bārī Sharh Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*. Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-Ilmiyyah, 1989.
- Bashin, Kamla dan Nighat Said Khan. *Persoalan Pokok Mengenai Feminisme dan Relevansinya*. Terj. S. Harlina. Jakarta: Gramedia, 1995.
- Bass, B.M. *Handbook of Leadership: Theory, Research & Managerial Applications*. New York: The Free Press, 1990.

- Al-Baghāwī. *Ma'ālim at Tanzīl fi at Tafsīr wa at Ta'wīl*. Beirut: Dār al Fikr, 2002.
- Baroroh, Umul. "Feminisme dan Feminis Muslim." In *Pemahaman Islam dan Tantangan Keadilan Gender*. (ed) Sri Suhandjati. Yogyakarta: Pusat Studi Gender IAIN Walisongo dan Gama Media, 2002.
- Brown, H. *Women Organising*. London: Routledge, 1992.
- Darwazah, Muhammad Izzah. *Al-Tafsīr al-Ḥadīth*. Beirut: Dār al-Gharb al-Islāmī, 2000.
- Republic of Indonesian Departmen. *Al-Quran dan Terjemahnya*. Jakarta: CV Indah Press, 2002.
- Dzuhayatin, Siti Ruhaini dkk. *Rekonstruksi Metodologis Wacana Kesetaraan Gender dalam Islam*. Yogyakarta: Ar-Ruzz Media, 2006.
- Engineer, Asghar Ali. *Hak-Hak Perempuan Dalam Islam*. Terj. Farid Wajidi dan Cici Farkha Assegaf. Yogyakarta: LSPPA Yayasan Prakarsa, 1994.
- Gherardi. *Gender, Symbolism, and Organizational Cultures*. London: Sage, 1995.
- Hasan, Riffat. "Perempuan Islam dan Islam Pasca Partiarkhi." In Fatima Marnissi dan Riffat Hasan. *Setara di Hadapan Allah*. Terj. Team LSPPA (Yogyakarta: LSPPA, 1995.
- Ibad, M. N. *Perempuan dalam perjuangan Gus Dur-Gus Miek*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pesantren, 2011.
- 'Imarah, Muhammad. *Al-Islām wa al-Mar'ah fī Ra'y Muḥammad 'Abduh*. Kairo: Dār al-Rashād, 1997.
- _____. *Tahrir al-Mar'ah baina al-Garb wa al-Islām*. Kairo: Maktabah Imām al-Bukhārī, 2009.
- Izzat, Hibbah Rauf. *Al-Mar'ah wa al-'Amal al-Siyāsī Ru'yah Islāmiyyah*. (Trans) Baharuddin al-Fanani dengan judul *Wanita dan Politik Pandangan Islam*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya, 1997.
- Mernissi, Fatimah. *Beyond The veil: Male-female Dynamic in Modern Muslim Society*. Indiana: Indiana University Press, 1987.
- _____. *Wanita di Dalam Islam*. (Trans) Yaziar Radiant. Bandung: Pustaka, 1991.
- Megawangi, Ratna. *Membiarkan Berbeda Sudut Pandang Baru Tentang Relas Gender*. Bandung: Mizan, 1999.
- Metcalf, B. Alimo. "An Investigation of Female and Male Constructs Of Leadership and Empowerment." *Women in Management Review* Vol. 10, 2 (1995).
- Muhammad, Husein. *Fiqh Perempuan: Refleksi Kiai terhadap Wacana Agama dan Gender*. Bantul: LKiS Yogyakarta. 2012.
- Mustaqim, Abdul. *Paradigma Tafsir Feminis, Membaca Al-Quran Dengan Optik Perempuan*. Yogyakarta: Logung Pustaka, 2008.

- _____. Amina Wadud. "Menuju Keadilan Gender." In A. Kudri Shaleh (ed). *Pemikiran Islam Kontemporer*. Yogyakarta: Jendela, 2000.
- Al-Qardawi, Yusuf. *Min Fiqh al-Dawlah fī al-Islām*. Cairo: Dār al Shurūq, 1997.
- _____. *Hadyu al-Islām Fatawi Mu'āsirah*. (Trans) As'ad Yasin With Title *Fatwa-Fatwa Kontemporer*. Jakarta: PT Gema Insani Press, 1996.
- Al-Qurṭūbī, Abī 'Abdillāh bin Aḥmad bin Muhammad. *Al-Jamī' fī Aḥkām al Qur'ān*. Bairut: Dār Kutub al-Ilmiyah, 1998.
- Qutb, Sayyid. *Tafsīr fī Zilāl al-Q ur'ān*. Beirut: Dār Kutub al-Ilmiyah, 1997.
- Riḍā', Muhammad Rashīd *Tafsīr al-Manār*. Beirut: Dār Kutub al-Ilmiyah, 1992.
- Saridjo, Marwan. *Cak Nur: di Antara Sarung dan Dasi dan Musdah Mulia Tetap Berjilbab*. Jakarta: Yayasan Ngali Aksara, 2005.
- Al-Ṣabūnī, Muḥammad 'Alī. *Ṣafwah al-Tafāsīr*. Beirut: Dār al Fikr, 2001.
- Subhan, Zaitunah. *Tafsīr Kebencian Studi Bias Gender Dalam Tafsir Qur'an*. Yogyakarta: LKiS, 1999.
- Al-Ṣuyūṭī, Jalāl al-Dīn *al-Dūr al-Mansūr fī al-Tafsīr bi al-Ma'thūr*. Kairo: Markaz al-Buhuthwa al-Dirāsāt al-'Arabiyyah wa al-Islāmiyyah, 1424 H/ 2003 M.
- Shihab, M. Quraish. *Wawasan Al Quran Tafsir Maudhu'i atas Pelbagai Persoalan Umat*. Bandung: Mizan Pustaka, 2005.
- Al-Ṭabārī, Muhammad ibn Jarīr. *Tafsīr al-Ṭabārī Jamī' al-Bayān 'an Ta'wīl Ay al-Qur'ān*, ditahqiq oleh 'Abdullah ibn 'Abd al-Muhsin al-Turki. Kairo: Markaz al-Buhuth wa al-Dirasat al-'Arabiyyah wa al-Islamiyyah, 2001 M/ 1422 H.
- Tim Redaksi Tanwir al-Afkar Ma'had 'Aly PP. Salafiyah Syafi'iah Situbondo. *Fiqh Rakyat Pertautan dengan Kekuasaan*. Yogyakarta: LKiS, 2000.
- Tuttle, Lisa. *Encyclopedia of Femenisme*. New York: Fates of File Publication, 1986.
- Wadud, Amina. *Qur'an Menurut Perempuan: Meluruskan Bias Gender dalam Tradisi*, terj. Abdullah Ali. Jakarta: Serambi, 2001.
- Wiyatmi. *Konstruksi Gender dalam Novel Geni Jora Karya Abidah El-Khalieqy*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2008.
- Zaprul Khan, "Rekonstruksi Peran Politik Perempuan Menurut Musda Mulia." *Jurnal Pemikiran Islam* (2015)
- Al-Zamakhsharī, Abū al-Qāsim Maḥmūd ibn 'Umar. *al-Kashshaf 'an Haqā'iq Gawāmid al-Tanzīl wa 'Uyūn al-Aqawī fī Wujūh al-Ta'wīl*. Riyad: Maktabah 'Abikan, 1998 M/1418 H.