The Effectiveness of Photo Story in Multiliteracies Learning towards Narrative Writing Skills of Fifth Grade of Elementary School Students

Budi Febriyanto*
* Primary Teacher Education Study Program, Faculty of Teacher Training and Education, University of Majalengka
E-mail: budifebriyanto88@gmail.com

Ari Yanto**
** Primary Teacher Education Study Program, Faculty of Teacher Training and Education, University of Majalengka
E-mail: ari.thea86@gmail.com

Received: August 24th, 2019; Accepted: October 04th, 2019; Published Online: October 29th, 2019

Abstract
This research is motivated by the low writing skill of students, especially in writing narratives. The purpose of this research is to determine the effectiveness of photo story media usage in multi-literacies learning model towards narrative writing skills of the fifth grade of elementary school. The research approach is quantitative with a quasi-experimental method by using a nonequivalent control groups design (ncgd) research design, with the experimental class using photo story media in a multi-literacies learning model and the control class using conventional learning. The population was the fifth grade students of Majalengka District. The research sample consisted of 60 students for experimental class and 60 students for control class. The data collection techniques used are tests, observations, and documentation, by using statistical data for data analysis. The results showed that there were differences narrative writing skills in the experimental class and the control class. The average of pre-test experimental class reached 57.53 and 75.33 for post-test and the n-gain value was 0.428 in the medium category. While the control class reached 57.40 for pre-test and the 67.1 for post-test and n-gain value of 0.237 is categorized as low level. It indicates that the used of photo story media in multiliteracies learning models is more effective in improving narrative writing skills of the fifth-grade elementary school students compared to conventional learning.

Keywords: multiliteracies learning, narrative writing skills, photo story media.
Budi Febriyanto, Ari Yanto, The Effectiveness of Photo Story ...


Kata kunci: pembelajaran multiliterasi, keterampilan menulis narasi, media foto cerita.

INTRODUCTION

Writing skills are different from other types of language skills, because writing skills are an activity of communicating using written language as the medium. Bascos-ocampo & Abayo-rillo (2016) states that specifically, writing is one kind of expression in language which is created by particular set of symbol, having conventional values for representing the wordings of particular language which is drawn up visually. Writing skills are language skills that must be possessed by elementary students to be able to communicate in written manner (Siddik, 2018). Furthermore, Abidin (2013) states that a process for expressing ideas and thoughts in written language is fundamental in writing. Students' ability to write is not obtained by themselves, but through a learning process. Students must practice starting from how to hold the stationery and to pay attention to the writings when they move their hand. Students must be trained to observe the writings, understand each particular letter, to write it correctly, as well as writing essays. In writing an essay there are stages required in order to make it become a complete essay and it is necessary to consider several indicators in writing the essay, namely the theme of the essay, the structure of the essay, grammar, choice of words and spelling.

One of the efforts to actualize the goals of the education process is through learning Indonesian Language in which there is writing exercises that can hone students' skills especially in narrative essay writing skills. However, the reality is that learning Indonesian Language especially in writing learning has not become a productive activities. The same thing was also stated by Suniyah, Rohmadi, & Sulistiyo (2018) that the fact of language learning carried out in most schools had not yet reached the stage of using Indonesian as a communication tool or could be said to be still limited to mere scientific mastery of language. The impact is on the students who still encounter many difficulties in making narrative essays. When elementary school students write narrative essays, they are only able to make a few words and then no longer be able to continue writing and
with a lack of vocabulary knowledge results in students using local languages for forgetting how the story goes (Sailo, 2017). Furthermore, Pakpahan (2019) argues that students' writing skills are currently declining and the used of diction and punctuation in the writing is not sufficiently considered or appropriate. Another opinion was also expressed that there are still many fifth grade students who do not understand writing lessons, this is because of the low vocabulary they have so that it is difficult for them to pour an appropriate sentence in writing (Meiroza & Guslinda, 2019). It is important for teachers to improve the quality of writing skills so that students have good writing competence.

Some of the factors that cause the low writing skills of students are that Indonesian language lessons are considered boring, monotonous, and less varied because the lessons refer more to learning topics without writing practice as well as not optimal learning media usage which is that can provide stimulus in the writing process. The low writing skills of students are also caused by other factors, one of which, according to Abidin (2013), is the tendency of teachers to prioritize grammar in writing rather than how to express ideas in writing. This resulted in students only being able to write grammatically well but lacking in writing content. Correspondingly, Mahyudin, Sukma, Desyandri, & Mansur (2017) revealed that the lack of students' writing skills was partly due to the fact that teachers still had difficulty choosing suitable methods to train students in learning writing skills and the media that teachers used were still limited. Thus, writing skills are important to be mastered by students. Therefore, it is necessary to improve the quality of Indonesian language learning. Sulak (2018) states that in order to maximize the writing performance of our students, there is a need for teaching practices that combine ICT [Information and Communications Technology] and cooperative writing. One of them is using learning media and learning models that are in line with the stages of writing education.

The purpose of using educational media is that educational media can help students in developing ideas or thoughts for their writing material. One of the ways is to used photo story media. Photo stories are included in audio visual media that can be designed by the teacher according to the learning needs. Daryanto (2013) explained that a photo story is a form of presentation of photos taken based on the topics or events needed so that they are arranged and each photo image can tell a story so the students can take the meaning of the picture. In the photo story media, there are several photos that compose a story or describe a story about the photo, even one photo can become a photo story if the contents of the photo description are very supportive for the photo itself.

The used of photo story media used in Indonesian language learning is expected to provide positive stimulus to students to undergo language learning activities with ease and fun. In line with this statement Krisbiono, Supriyanto, & Rustono (2016) said that to express ideas in writing texts
requires an appropriate model and media in a creative, innovative, and fun sense for students. Citrawati, Supriyanto, & Suminar (2018) further said that students preferred visual media that looked interesting and contained pictures or photos of stories that were in accordance with the characteristics of elementary school students. Thus, the used of photo story media will foster students' skills and creativity in writing activities and can improve the quality of Indonesian language learning in writing an essay, especially writing narrative essays.

The choice of learning models combined with suitable learning media greatly influences the achievement of learning objectives. In the learning process through the learning model the learning process is designed with the right pattern and becomes a reference for how the learning activities are carried out so that it can make learning more planned with certain patterns to achieve the expected goals. The learning model that can be integrated with photo story media is a multiliteracies learning model.

Multi-literacies learning model is a learning model that integrates literacy concepts to support learning needs. Navehebrahim (2011) states that the multiliteracies approach is an integration of multiple forms of knowledge, including video images and combinations of forms in digital contexts which support producing effective learning outcomes as learners are motivated to learn throughout creative activities created by the teacher using the multiliteracies framework. Multi-literacies is related to the diversity of media, cultural diversity, diversity of scientific contexts, diversity of intelligence, diversity of learning styles, and diversity of capital and learning modes (Abidin, 2015). More specifically it is said that multiliteracies is the skill to used various ways to express and understand ideas and information using conventional text forms as well as innovative texts, symbols, and multimedia (Abidin, 2017). Furthermore, suggested that multiliteracies is a learning concept that can be used to understand various types of texts and media produced through various new technologies through the concept of pedagogy that gives teachers the opportunity to convey information to students using various texts and media (Abidin, Mulyati, & Yunansah, 2017). Multiliteracies learning is one of the learning designs in accordance with the context of the 2013 curriculum. The concept of multiliteracies is designed to answer the skills needed in the 21st century. Multiliteracies is about having the knowledge and skills that are necessary for learners to understand, discuss, reflect and used multiple representations of texts, such as in current technological resources to participate effectively in a variety of formal situations such as economy and work, and social situations such as leisure and cultural activities (Puthe-behak & Ismail, 2018). Multi-literacies learning is designed to be able to connect four language skills as a form of communication skills supported by a variety of technology-based learning media, one of which is photo story media. Therefore, the multiliteracies learning model was chosen as a learning model that facilitates the used of photo story media.
Previous research on the use of *photo story* media carried out by Bagiya (2014) showed that the application of *photo story* media improved the skills of writing drama scripts in eleventh grade high school students. Furthermore, the research conducted by Wulanadari, Riyanto, & Subroto (2018) revealed that the application of a cooperative model with the types of *teams games tournament* with *photo story* media can improve learning outcomes of social studies subjects in fifth grade elementary school students. The results of his research Maufur (2016) also revealed that the use of sketch drawing media had a significant effect on the ability to write essay descriptions. Research on writing learning conducted by Sutarna (2016), Robbi’atna & Subrata (2019), Yafi, Santoso, & Mudiono (2017) states that the application of the learning model contributes positively to improving student writing. Different from the previous research, in this research, *photo story* media is used in multiliteracies learning models in language learning, especially learning to write narrative essays of elementary school students. Based on these descriptions, this object of this research is to examine the effectiveness of the use of *photo story* media in multiliteracies learning models on narrative writing skills of fifth grade elementary school students.

**METHODS**

The research adopts quantitative approach. The purpose of this study is to produce *photo story* media and learning models that are tested for their effectiveness to be applied to the learning process of narrative writing in elementary schools. To achieve this, quasi-experimental research methods are used as quasi-experimental research where the research subjects are not randomly grouped, but accept the subject as it is (Ruseffendi, 2006). The study design used *Nonequivalent [Pre-Test and Post-Test] Control Groups Design* (NCGD) in this design the experimental group (A) and the control group (B) were selected without a random placement procedure (*without random as-signment*) in the two groups, as well as the pre-test and post-test only the experimental group was given treatment (Creswell, 2014). The experimental class and the control class were chosen not randomly, but accepted the subject matter as is. Then both classes were given pre-test and post-test and only the experimental group was given treatment using *photo story* media in multiliteracies learning. While the control class with conventional learning.

The population of this research is the fifth grade students in Majalengka District, with sample selection using *purposive sampling*. According to Bungin (2011), this sampling technique is used in researches that prioritize research objectives rather than the nature of the population in determining the research sample, so that the data obtained are more representative. Fifth grade students of Cigasong 1 State Elementary School, Cigasong 2 State Elementary School, Tonjong 1 State Elementary School and Tonjong 3 State Elementary School as research subjects divided into experimental and control classes.
Tests and observations are used as the data collection techniques in this study. The instruments in this study were divided into learning instruments and data collection instruments. The learning instrument consists of photo story media with multi-literacies learning models contained in the learning implementation plan as well as teacher and student teaching materials. While the data collection instruments were observation sheets and narrative writing test sheets. The assessment of narrative writing includes indicators of scope and content, organization and appearance of content, style and accuracy, grammar, and spelling.

Based on the data obtained in this study, namely qualitative and quantitative data, the technique that will be used to analyze qualitative data is descriptive analysis. This descriptive analysis is used to determine and obtain the idea of learning using photo story media in multiliteracies learning models. Meanwhile, quantitative data analysis techniques are used to answer research hypotheses related to differences in abilities between learning using photo story media in multiliteracies learning models compared to conventional learning. The stages of quantitative data analysis used a statistical method that is the difference test with the help of SPSS version 20, then for the analysis of differences in narrative writing skills improvement using n-gain calculations. The stages of quantitative data analysis using statistics are carried out in several stages. These stages are (1) descriptive data analysis, (2) analysis of normality and homogeneity tests, (3) analysis of difference tests using t tests or other suitable tests, and (4) analysis of different tests using n-gain.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The Narrative Writing Skills of Fifth Grade Students in Elementary Schools

The data analysed in this study were pre-test scores, post-test scores and n-gain description writing skills of control class students and experimental class students. The pre-test score shows the score before treatment and the post-test score shows the score after treatment. A description of the pre-test, post-test and n-gain score of narrative writing skills is presented in the following table.

Table 1. Description of Pretest and Post-Test Data for Experiment and Control Classes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Descriptive Statistics</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Minimum</th>
<th>Maximum</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pretest of Experiment Class</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>57,53</td>
<td>14,804</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest of Experiment Class</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>75,33</td>
<td>9,830</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest of Control Class</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>57,40</td>
<td>12,602</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posttest of Control Class</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>67,13</td>
<td>12,013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valid N (listwise)</td>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the table 1, it is known that the ability of narrative writing skills of the students prior to treatment (pretest) is the same, both in the experimental class and control class average is
However, after the treatment of the use of photo story media in the multi-literacies learning model in the experimental class the average has changed. The average post-test experimental class reached 75.33 while the control class was only 67.13. The difference between the pre-test and post-test data of the experimental class and the control class in narrative writing skills can also be seen based on the following graph.

Graph 1. Comparison of Pretest and Post-Test Grade of Experiment and Control Classes

Furthermore, to see whether the average difference is significant or not, the researchers used an analytical test *Independent Analysis of The T-test Samples*. The results of the t-test for the narrative writing skills pretest data are shown in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Narrative Writing</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Sig. (2-tailed)</th>
<th>Mean Difference</th>
<th>Std. Error Difference</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval of the Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances assumed</td>
<td>.053</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>.958</td>
<td>.133</td>
<td>2.510</td>
<td>-4.837 - 5.104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances not assumed</td>
<td>.053</td>
<td>115.06</td>
<td>.958</td>
<td>.133</td>
<td>2.510</td>
<td>-4.838 - 5.105</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to the table 2, it is shown that the significance value of the average difference test on narrative writing skills pretest data on the experimental class and control class is 0.958 which is greater than 0.05. Then the hypothesis $H_0$ is accepted $H_1$ is rejected. This means that there
is no difference in the narrative writing skills between the experimental class and the control class. The results of the narrative writing skills post-test data t-test are shown in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Narrative Writing</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Sig. (2-tailed)</th>
<th>Mean Difference</th>
<th>Std. Error Difference</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval of the Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances assumed</td>
<td>4,092</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>8,200</td>
<td>2.004</td>
<td>4.232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances not assumed</td>
<td>4,092</td>
<td>113,552</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>8,200</td>
<td>2.004</td>
<td>4.230</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the above table 3, it can be seen that the average difference test in the narrative writing skills post-test data in the experimental class and the control class obtained a significance value of 0.000 less than 0.05. Then the hypothesis H<sub>0</sub> is rejected H<sub>1</sub> is accepted. This means that there are differences in narrative writing skills post-test between the experimental class and the control class. The narrative writing skills of the experimental class are better than the control class.

The Improvement of Narrative Writing Skills between Experimental Classes and Control Classes

The results of research on the differences in narrative writing skills between the experimental class and the control class indicate that there is a difference in narrative writing skills between the experimental class and the control class, so the next step is to analyze the increase (n-gain) of the narrative writing skills between the experimental class and the control class to find out its effectiveness. N-gain data normality test results of narrative writing skills are presented in the following table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Class</th>
<th>Tests of Normality</th>
<th>Kolmogorov-Smirnov&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
<th>Shapiro-Wilk</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Statistic</td>
<td>Df</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n-gain_persen</td>
<td>Experiment</td>
<td>.149</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Control</td>
<td>.098</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the table 4, it can be seen that the results of the n-gain normality data test of the narrative writing skills of the experimental class get a significance value of 0.002 smaller than 0.005 so that the data is declared "abnormal". While the results of the n-gain normality data test results of the control class narrative writing skills obtained a significance value of 0.200 greater than 0.005.
so that the data was declared "normal". Through these data, then Mann Whitney test will be used for the comparative test of narrative writing skills n-gain data. That is because the experimental class data is not normally distributed even though the control class is normally distributed so that the data does not need to be tested for homogeneity. The results of the n-gain data of narrative writing skills appear in the table below.

Table 5. N-gain Data Difference Test for Narrative Writing Skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Test Statistics</th>
<th>Ngain</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mann-Whitney U</td>
<td>424,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilcoxon W</td>
<td>2254,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Z</td>
<td>-7,234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the above table 5, it can be seen that the n-gain data test of narrative writing skills in the experimental class and the control class obtained a significance value of 0.000 less than 0.05. Then the hypothesis H0 is rejected H1 is accepted. This means that there are differences in n-gain of narrative writing skills between the experimental class and the control class.

Based on the results of data analysis, it can be seen that the Media Photo Story in the Multi-literacies Learning Model is more effective in improving narrative writing skills. Effectiveness is indicated by an increase in the pre-test and post-test scores of the experimental class. In addition, the quality of improvement can also be shown from the category of higher n-gain values. The pre-test scores of students in both the experimental and control classes were the same, namely an average of 57. After giving treatment using photo story media in the Multi-literacies Learning Model in the experimental class and conventional methods in the control class, the post-test scores of the two groups showed differences. The average experimental class post-test was 75 while the average control class was only 67. The quality of improvement is also indicated by the difference in the gain of the two classes. The gain in the experimental class reached 0.428 which can be interpreted moderate while in the control class the gain only reached 0.236 which can be interpreted low.

Referring to the presentation of the results of research on narrative writing skills, it can be said that the narrative writing skills of fifth grade elementary school students who used photo story media in multiliteracies learning models are better than those using conventional learning. Thus, the combination of photo story media and multiliteracies learning models has a positive effect on learning. Photo story media as a technology-based audio visual media provides a positive stimulus in language learning. In line with the results of the study, Idris (2015) states that Audio-visuals make the language teaching and learning, effective making the class interactive and interesting, motivating the learners, facilitating language skills and so many. If teachers can utilize the audio-
visual aids prudently, the language teaching and learning will become effective. Furthermore, Bradbury (2014) states about a quarter of the students in the class voiced, from the outset, a more “instrumentalist” view of technology—unquestioningly embracing technology as a tool teachers can and should use to engage students in reading and writing activities in the literacy classroom. Wulandari's research results reinforce that the used of photo story media has proven to be effective in improving learning outcomes, especially in increasing the social studies activities and learning outcomes of students who increase each cycle (Wulandari et al., 2018).

Furthermore, Susilo & Ramdiati (2019) stated the results of his research that the success of using the multiliteracies model in every research action, was carried out by researchers using newspaper, magazine, newspaper, microphone, video, to help students in learning process. The success in improving narrative writing skills is in accordance with the advantages of photo story media that can facilitate students in narrative writing activities. Hidayat et al. (2017) further stated that photo stories are able to convey strong messages, arouse enthusiasm, raised morale, entertain as well to provoke a debate. Media photo story has several advantages, including being able to convey messages and lessons effectively, can improve students' learning abilities in the classroom, train students to think systematically and logically, and can increase student motivation because photo story media is the latest media at this time which students are presented with a variety of different photos that compose a story.

The multi-literacies learning model with photo story media is appropriate to be used to improve narrative writing skills because the stages of learning support students to collaborate with their groups in the work they are making. In his research Nopilda & Kristiawan (2018) stated that in the multiliteracies learning process of writing, students are invited to write multicontext, multimedia, and multicultural. In this case the photo story becomes part as a medium used in multiliteracies learning that contains content based on the learning theme. Furthermore, Ginanjar & Widayanti (2018) in his research stated conceptually that multiliteracies is a learning design that gives teachers to present information to students through a variety of texts or other learning media produced from new technologies. Febriyanto & Yanto (2019) research results suggest that the multiliteracies learning model brings better learning activities through increased student and teacher activities in learning. Thus it can be concluded that the multiliteracies model supports when integrated with photo story media that can provide improved Indonesian language learning processes and outcomes, especially narrative writing skills.

CONCLUSION

The used of photo story media in multiliteracies learning models is more effective in improving narrative writing skills compared to conventional learning. T-test results of narrative writing skills in the experimental class and the control class in the pre-test are the same. This shows
that both classes have relatively similar initial skills. Furthermore, the results of the post-test narrative writing skills t-test in the experimental class and the control class showed differences. The average value of writing an experimental class narrative is higher than the control class. The quality of improving narrative writing skills can also be seen from the n-gain value of the experimental class which is in the moderate category while the control class is in the low category. The average value of experimental class narrative writing is higher than the control class. Empirically, *photo story* media in multi-literacies learning models is more effective in improving narrative writing skills than conventional learning. This research is expected to provide a new paradigm in the process of learning to write in elementary schools. Technology-based media, photo story can be an alternative to make learning more interesting. The packaging of Indonesian languagen learning by integrating multi-literacies learning models and photo story media directly contributes to student learning activities. This research is expected to be used as a reference material in developing Indonesian language learning, especially in improving other language skills.

**REFERENCES**


Budi Febriyanto, Ari Yanto, The Effectiveness of Photo Story ...


